



Opening a bottle on Shabbat and asking someone else to do it?

1. Ashkenazic poskim hold that one may not open a bottle with a metal cap for the first time on Shabbos because removing the cap separates the ring from the cap and makes the cap into a useable vessel. One may make a hole using a knife in the cap if there aren't letters or pictures on it so that makes it unfit for a cap afterwards and then one may open the bottle.¹ However, it's permissible to open a bottle with a plastic bottle cap (because it had the form of a cap before it was attached).² Some Ashkenazic poskim and Sephardic poskim hold it's permissible to open bottles with metal or plastic caps but add that one who is strict to open them before Shabbat will be blessed.³
2. Someone who holds that it's forbidden to open a bottle on Shabbat is forbidden to ask another Jew who holds that it's permissible to open a bottle on Shabbat.⁴ However, some say that if one is only strict based on the minhag of his Rabbis or father one may ask someone who holds it's permissible.⁵

1. **Shemirat Shabbat KeHilchata** 9:17 (new edition 9:18), Shabbos Kitchen (Rabbi Simcha Bunim Cohen, pg 184-6). [39 Melachos (Rabbi Ribiat, vol 3, pg 841) writes that a less preferable option is to twist off the cap and discard it immediately (and it may be useful to have another cap handy).]

2. **Shemirat Shabbat KeHilchata** 9:18 (new edition), 39 Melachos (Rabbi Ribiat, vol 3, pg 841)

3. **Rabbi Mordechai Willig** (heard in person; see also Am Mordechai (Shabbat, Siman 29, pg 161)). **Yalkut Yosef** (vol 2, pg 517, 675).

4. The **39 Melachos (Rabbi Ribiat, vol 1, pg 93)** writes that it's forbidden to ask a fellow Jew to open a can or bottle for him on Shabbat if the one requesting holds that one is forbidden to do so. He supports this with Sh"t Igrot Moshe 4:119:5. Many poskim also forbid including Tal Imrati (18:11, pg 190) quoting **Chacham Ben Tzion Abba Shaul**, **Yalkut Yosef** (Shabbat, vol 3, pg 217-9) quoting **Rav Ovadyah Yosef**, **Banim Chavivim** (Siman 18, pg 91) quoting **Rabbi Eliezer Waldenburg** (from Meor HaShabbat (vol 1, Peninei HaMeor pg 552)) and **Rav Chaim Kanievsky** (from Meor HaShabbat (vol 2, pg 77)).

Rav Yisrael Belsky in **Shulchan HaLevi** (vol 1, Birur Halacha 10, pg 339) also rules stringently and gives four reasons.

(1) **Shelichut LeDvar Avierah**. In the Gemara Bava Metsia 10b there is a dispute between Ravina and Rami Bar Chama regarding Shaliach LeDvar Avierah. Ravina holds that there's only Ein Shaliach LeDvar Avierah when the one being sent is obligated in that prohibition, while Rami Bar Chama says that there's Ein Shaliach LeDvar Avierah whenever the one

being sent has the ability to choose to do it or not. The Rama C"m 182:1 rules like Ravina and so if the one being sent isn't obligated then there is Shelichut. Rav Belsky concludes that since the one being sent follows a Rabbi who holds it's permissible to open a bottle he's considered not obligated in that prohibition and there would be Shelichut. Thus, if he is asked by someone who doesn't open the bottle there would be a Deoritta violation of Shabbat.

(2) **Lifnei Iver**. Rav Belsky writes that since the opinion of those who hold it is forbidden is that it is forbidden for all Jews it would be forbidden to ask another Jew because of Lifnei Iver.

(3) **Amirah LeYisrael**. He quotes the Radvaz 4:258 who forbids Amirah LeYisrael because it should be no better than Amirah LeNochri.

(4) **Degrading one's friend**. By asking one's friend to do something which one holds is forbidden is treating him like a Shabbos goy or a less important Jew. Rav Belsky concludes that it's forbidden to ask him to open the bottle and it would be just as forbidden to ask him to open it for himself to drink because all the reasons apply except (perhaps) the first one. Though, he agrees that if the one who holds it is permissible opened it for himself it is permissible for others to benefit from the contents of the bottle.

5. **Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach** (Meor HaShabbat (Peninei HaMeor 3:8)) rules that if the one requesting holds it's forbidden based on his ruling, then, it's forbidden to ask someone who holds it's permitted to do it for him, however, if the one requesting is only strict because of the minhag of his Rabbis or father, then it's permitted to ask someone else to do that act.

Note: This is not an official YU RIETS production. I showed this to Rabbi Willig and Rabbi Schachter. If you have any questions please contact me at 973-202-7268 or ikesultan@gmail.com - Ike Sultan (a student in MYP)