



Chanuka Candles for Yeshiva Student

1. Some say that according to Sephardim, a yeshiva student fulfills his obligation with his father's lighting at home. According to Ashkenazim, however, a student fulfills his primary obligation with his father but still should light himself in order to fulfill the Mehadrin. Others, however, argue that a student does not fulfill his obligation with his father if he is not at home for Chanuka.¹
2. Some say that one fulfills his obligation with lighting in the lobby of the dorms. Others argue that one would fulfill his obligation only if he lights on the same floor as his room. Due to safety considerations, though, our Yeshiva, forbids lighting on any floor where there are dorms other than in the lounge on the 2nd floor of Muss.²

1. Rav Hershel Schachter (B'ikvei HaTzon p. 123-4) writes that a man does not fulfill his obligation with the lighting of his wife in another city unless he actually goes home later that night. Similarly, he stated ("Where to light Neiros Chanukah in the dorm," min 24) that a yeshiva student does not fulfill his obligation with his father's lighting in another city unless he is at home that night.

Rav Mordechai Willig (Am Mordechai Moadim p. 104-5), though, argues that a man fulfills his primary obligation with his wife's lighting at home even if he is a guest somewhere else. Similarly, a student can fulfill his primary obligation with his parent's lighting at home. However, according to the minhag of the Rama, Ashkenazim still may light with a bracha even if someone is lighting for them at home. Similarly, Rav Ovadia Yosef (Chazon Ovadia Chanuka p. 150) writes that a Sephardi student fulfills his obligation with his father's lighting even if he is in yeshiva.

2. The Gemara (Shabbat 21b) establishes that the primary place for Chanuka candles is right outside the door of one's house. Rashi (s.v. Mibachutz) explains that even if one has a courtyard in front of his house, he still is obligated to light by the entrance of one's house. Tosfot (s.v. Mitzvah), on the other hand, argue that in such a case, one should light at the entrance to the courtyard, as it connects to the public thoroughfare. Although the Ran (9b s.v. Tanu) agrees with Rashi, the Tur and S"A 671:5 cite the view of Tosfot.

Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (Halichot Shlomo 14:4) holds that if one lives in an apartment building, he should light by the entrance to the apartment building, as it leads out to the street. He explains that the staircase that goes from one's apartment to the building entrance is considered a courtyard, and one should light at the entrance of the courtyard in accordance with the opinion of Tosfot. He adds that the staircase is

considered a courtyard even if people don't use it as people would use their private home.

On the other hand, regarding Eruvin, the Chazon Ish (OC 65:52) posits that nowadays, there is no such thing as a halachic courtyard because we don't treat courtyards or streets as extensions of the house as they did in the days of Chazal. Therefore, the Chazon Ish (quoted in Shevut Yitzchak Chanuka p. 6) rules that one may not light Chanuka candles by the entrance to a courtyard because it is not considered a halachic courtyard.

Rabbi Mordechai Willig (oral communication) said that even according to the Chazon Ish one could explain the minhag of the yeshiva to light at the dorm building entrances because people walk around more casually in the dorms than they would in the street.

Rav Hershel Schachter (ibid. min 1-6) explained that perhaps a yeshiva student living in the dorms cannot fulfill his obligation by lighting in the lobby, as the staircase is not considered a courtyard. He added that the hallways of each floor are considered courtyards because they really are used for private uses, as people walk around in bathrobes when going to take a shower. Regarding lighting on a floor other than where one lives, there is less room to believe that the stairwell is considered a courtyard. Regarding whether someone who lives on the 3rd floor of Muss would fulfill his obligation by lighting in the 2nd floor lounge, refer to the shiur above. Rav Schachter (oral communication) stated explicitly that it is absolutely forbidden to light in the dorm rooms without permission. As such, one either should light at home or, if that is not feasible, he should light in the lobby after hearing the brachot from someone else.

See Rav Baruch Simon (Imrei Baruch Eruvin p. 40-1), in discussing the Chazon Ish, argues that there is room to distinguish between Eruvin and Chanuka regarding the definition of a courtyard.